

Philosophy 313
Global Health Ethics

Spring 2024
Meliora 219, W 2:00-4:40

Richard Dees, Ph.D.
Office: Lattimore 529
Hours: Th 11:00-1:00
and by appointment
richard.dees@rochester.edu

The world is interconnected, and what happens in one country affects—both directly and indirectly—what happens in other countries. For health issues this fact is especially true, as the rapid spread of Covid-19 vividly demonstrated. The moral issues that arise from these interconnections are particularly vexing, and this class will examine some of them. Is the 40-year gap in life expectancy between Sierra Leone and Japan unjust? Is the “brain drain” of health care workers from poorer countries to richer countries unfair? Does the global market in organs create ethical problems? Do obligations do individuals and countries have to alleviate the health burdens in the world? If so, how great is that obligation? How can such aid be provided ethically?

Required Texts:

Other readings on Blackboard

Course Requirements:

Class participation is worth a significant portion of your grade. The class is based on student discussions, not on lectures. You are expected to come to class, and you are expected to come to class prepared to discuss the readings – if only to ask relevant questions about them. Most of your class participation grade is based on regular, substantive participation in class discussions.

Reflection papers. Five times during the semester, you will be expected to write a brief 1-2 page double-spaced reaction paper to the upcoming week’s reading, due at 9:00 p.m. on the Tuesday before class. Please email them to me. These papers should respond to some specific arguments or position in the readings by explaining why you agree or disagree with it. Each is worth 8 points. You can find the group assignments in the Assignments folder.

Paper assignments. The major assignments in this course will be done using a tutorial system. For the first two papers, I will give you a series of questions about particular texts, and I will ask you to respond to them in a paper of 6-8 pages. You and another student will meet with me in my office during the time set aside for that purpose. Together, the three of us will discuss each of your papers. While attending a tutorial is required, you will be graded only on what is in your paper. I will explain the tutorial method in more detail later.

For your final assignment, you will have a choice: you may either write a third tutorial of 7-10 pages on a topic I will give you, or you may write a 7-10 page paper on a topic of your own choosing. This latter option will give you the opportunity to explore an issue of particular

interest to you at greater length. Note that the paper must be a *philosophy* paper: it should explain and evaluate a line of argument that death. I will be happy, however, to help you develop your topic. In any case, if you choose to write a paper, you *must* consult me.

In addition, students are encouraged to form study groups to discuss the issues raised in the course. If you have a group and you would like me to meet with it, please contact me, and I will be happy to attend.

The course grade is divided into 540 points, apportioned as shown:

First tutorial	Feb 21	120 points
Second tutorial	Mar 27	120 points
Final assignment	Apr 24	140 points
Reaction papers		40 points
Participation		140 points

Academic honesty: The Honor Pledge will be required on the papers for the course. I expect the work on these assignments to be your own; all quotations and *ideas from others* that are used in your work must be properly cited. The reflections papers are more informal, so I do not expect rigorous citations or the Pledge, but I do expect the work to be your own. This is an ethics course, and I take a particularly dim view of violations of academic honesty. Please consult the College's policy at www.rochester.edu/College/honesty/. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Schedule of Readings

This schedule is tentative (especially for topics later in the course). However, any changes will be announced on Blackboard, and an up-to-date copy of the syllabus can always be found on Blackboard. All readings, except those in the required books for the class, are on Blackboard.

Jan 17 Introduction
Ivan Illich, "To Hell with Good Intentions"

I. The ethics of globalized health care

Brain drain

WHO Global Code of Practice on the International Recruitment of Health Personnel, May 2010

Abraar Karan, Daniel DeUgarte, and Michele Barry, "Medical 'Brain Drain' and Health," *AMA Journal of Ethics* 18 (2016): 665-75

Javier S. Hidalgo, "The Active Recruitment of Health Workers: A Defence," *Journal of Medical Ethics* 39 (2013): 603-09

Gillian Brock, "Is Active Recruitment of Health Workers Really Guilty of Enabling Harm or Facilitating Wrongdoing?," *Journal of Medical Ethics* 39 (2013): 612-14

Kiran Oberman, "Can Brain Drain Justify Immigration Restrictions?," *Ethics* 123 (2013): 427-55

Luara Ferracioli and Pable De Lora, "Primum Nocere: Medical Brain Drain and the Duty to Stay," *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* 50 (2015): 601-19

Jan 24

Medical tourism

I. Glenn Cohen, "Medical Tourism," in *Routledge Companion to Bioethics*, ed. John Arras, Elizabeth Fenton, and Quill (Rebecca) Kukla (London: Routledge, 2015), 99-113

Cynthia Cohen and Peter Cohen, "International Stem Cell Tourism and the Need for Effective Regulation. Part 1: Stem Cell Tourism in Russia and India: Clinical Research, Innovative Treatment, or Unproven Hype," *Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal* 20 (2010): 27-49

Charles Murdoch and Christopher Thomas Scott, "Stem Cell Tourism and the Power of Hope," *American Journal of Bioethics* 10.5 (2010): 16-23

Y.Y. Brandon Chen and Colleen Flood, "Medical Tourism's Impact on Health Care Equity and Access in Low- and Middle-Income Countries: Making the Case for Regulation," *Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics* 41 (2013): 286-300

G.K.D. Crozier, "Reproductive Travel and Tourism," in Arras, Fenton, and Kukla, 393-402

Vida Panitch, "Surrogate Tourism and Reproductive Rights," *Hypatia* 28 (2013): 274-89

Group B reflection due, 9 pm, January 23

Jan 30

Organ markets

Nancy Scheper-Hughes, "Mr. Tati's Holiday and João's Safari—Seeing the World Through Transplant Tourism," *Body and Society* 17 (2011): 55-92

Janet Radcliffe-Richards, et al. "The Case for Allowing Kidney Sales," *Lancet* 352 (1998): 1950-52

Michael Gill and Robert Sade, "Paying for Kidneys: The Case Against Prohibition," *Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal* 12 (2002): 17-45

Paul M. Hughes, "Exploitation, Autonomy, and the Case for Organ Sales," *International Journal of Applied Philosophy* 12 (1998): 89-95

I. Glenn Cohen, "Transplant Tourism: The Ethics and Regulation of International Markets for Organs," *Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics* 41 (2013): 269-85

Group A reflection due, 9 pm, January 29

Feb 7

Global research

World Medical Association, Declaration of Helsinki: Ethical Principles for Medical Research Involving Human Subjects

Ezekiel J. Emanuel, David Wendler, Jack Killen, and Christine Grady, "What Makes Clinical Research in Developing Countries Ethical? The

Benchmarks of Ethical Research,” *Journal of Infectious Diseases* 189 (2004): 930-37

Peter Lurie and Sidney M. Wolfe, “Unethical Trials of Interventions to Reduce Perinatal Transmission of the Human Immunodeficiency Virus in Developing Countries,” *New England Journal of Medicine* 337 (1997): 853-56

Marcia Angell, “Investigators’ Responsibilities for Human Subjects in Developing Countries,” *New England Journal of Medicine* 342 (2000): 967-69; Ronald H. Gray, Thomas C. Quinn, David Serwadda, Nelson K. Sewankambo, Fred Wabware-Mangen, Maria J. Wawer, “The Ethics of Research in Developing Countries,” *New England Journal of Medicine* 343 (2000): 361-62; Marcia Angell, “Reply,” *New England Journal of Medicine* 343 (2000): 363.

Carol Levine, “Placebos and HIV Lessons Learned,” *Hastings Center Report* 28.6 (1998): 43-48

Ezekiel Emanuel, “Global Justice and the ‘Standards of Care’ Debate,” in Joseph Millum and Ezekiel, eds., *Bioethics and Global Justice* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 181-212

Alan Wertheimer, “The Obligations of Researchers Amidst Injustice or Deprivation,” in Millum and Emanuel, 279-304
Group B reflection due, 9 pm, February 6

Feb 14

New drugs and property rights

P. Chirac, R. von Schoen-Angerer, T. Kasper, and N. Ford, “AIDS: Patent Rights versus Patient’s Rights,” *Lancet* 356 (2000): 502

Donald Berwick, “ ‘We All Have AIDS’: Case for Reducing the Cost of AIDS Drugs to Zero,” plus commentaries from Richard Sykes and Zackie Achmat, *British Medical Journal* 324 (2002): 214-218

Anand Grover, Brian Citro, Mihir Mankad, and Fiona Lander, “Pharmaceutical Companies and Global Lack of Access to Medicines: Strengthening Accountability under the Right to Health,” *Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics* 40 (2012): 234-50

Mathias Risse, “Is There a Human Right to Essential Pharmaceuticals?” in Millum and Emanuel, 43-77

Nicole Hassoun, “Global Health Impact: A Basis for Labeling and Licensing Campaigns?,” *Developing World Bioethics* 12 (2012): 121-34

Aisling McMahon, “Global Equitable Access to Vaccines, Medicines, and Diagnostics for COVID-19: The Role of Patents as Private Governance,” *Journal of Medical Ethics* 47 (2021): 142-48

Group A reflection due, 9 pm, February 13

Feb 21

First tutorials (No regular class meeting)

II. Health justice for the world

- Feb 28 Female genital cutting
 WHO statement on Female Genital Mutilation (2023)
 Martha Nussbaum, “Judging Other Cultures: The Case of Genital Mutilation,” in *Sex and Social Justice* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 118-29
 Clare Chambers, “Are Breast Implants Better than Female Genital Mutilation?: Autonomy, Gender Equality, and Nussbaum’s Political Liberalism,” *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* 7.3 (2004): 1-33
 S.K. Hellsten, “Rationalising Circumcision: From Tradition to Fashion, From Public Health to Individual Freedom—Critical Notes on the Persistence of the Practice of Genital Mutilation,” *Journal of Medical Ethics* 30 (2004): 248-53
 Public Policy Advisory Network on Female Genital Surgeries, “Seven Things to Know about Female Genital Surgeries,” *Hastings Center Report* 42.6 (2012): 19-27
 Brian Earp, “Between Moral Relativism and Moral Hypocrisy: Reframing the Debate on ‘FGM,’” *Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal* 26 (2016): 105-44
Group B reflection due, 9 pm, February 27
- Mar 6 The work of NGOs
 Adamson Muulu, “We Are Not Just a ‘Tiny Landlocked Impoverished Sub-Saharan Country with HIV Burden,’” *Croatian Medical Journal* 51 (2010): 560-62
 Lisa Fuller, “International NGO Health Programs in a Non-ideal World: Imperialism, Respect, and Procedural Justice,” in Millum and Emanuel, 213-40
 Anji Wall, “The Context of Ethical Problems in Medical Volunteer Work,” *HEC Forum* 23 (2011): 79-90
 L. Lewis Wall, “Ethical Concerns Regarding Operations by Volunteer Surgeons on Vulnerable Patient Groups: The Case of Women with Obstetric Fistulas,” *HEC Forum* 23 (2011): 115-27
 Lisa Fuller, “Justified Commitments?: Considering Resource Allocation and Fairness in Médecins Sans Frontières-Holland,” *Developing World Bioethics* 6 (2006): 59-70
Group A reflection due, 9 pm, March 5
- Mar 13 *Spring Break (No classes)*
- Mar 20 Global justice
 Peter Singer, “Famine, Affluence, and Morality,” *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 1 (1972): 279-43
 Thomas Pogge, “Priorities of Global Justice,” *Metaphilosophy* 32 (2001): 6-24
 Onora O’Neill, “Agents of Justice,” *Metaphilosophy* 32 (2001): 180-95

Thomas Nagel, "The Problem of Global Justice," *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 33 (2005): 113-47

Paul Farmer, "On Suffering and Structural Violence: Social and Economic Rights in the Global Era," in *Pathologies of Power: Health, Human Rights, and the New War on the Poor* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), 29-50

Group B reflection due, 9 pm, March 19

Mar 27 *Second tutorials (No regular class meeting)*

Apr 3 Global justice and health

Declaration of Alma Ata (1978)

Joseph Millum, "Global Bioethics and Political Theory," in *Global Justice and Bioethics*, ed. Joseph Millum and Ezekiel Emanuel (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 17-42

Jonathan Wolff, "The Demands of the Human Right to Health," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 86 (2012): 217-37

Gopal Sreenivasan, "A Human Right to Health?: Some Inconclusive Scepticism," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 86 (2012): 239-65

Allen Buchanan and Matthew DeCamp, "Responsibility for Global Health," *Theoretical Medicine and Bioethics* 27 (2006): 95-114

Group A reflection due, 9 pm, April 2

Apr 10 Global poverty and health

Angus Deaton, "Health in the Age of Globalization," *Brookings Trade Forum* (2004): 81-130

Lucy Thompson, "Extreme Poverty Has Been Sharply Cut. What Has Changed?" *New York Times*, 2 December 2021

Paul Farmer, Peter Drobac, and Zoe Agoos, "The Colonial Roots of Global Health," *Harvard College Global Health Review* 2009

Helen Tilley, "Medicine, Empire, and Ethics in Colonial Africa," *AMA Journal of Ethics* 18 (2016): 743-53

Ted Schrecker, Anne-Emmanuelle Birn, and Mariajosé Aguilera, "Challenging the Global Extractive Order: A Global Health Imperative," in *Global Health: Ethical Challenges*, 2nd ed., ed. Solomon Benatar and Gillian Brock (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2021), 256-68

Group B reflection due, 9 pm, April 9

Apr 17 Pandemics

World Health Organization, *Ethical Considerations in Developing a Public Health Response to Pandemic Influenza* (2007)

Lawrence Gostin, "Pandemic Influenza: Public Health Preparedness for the Next Global Health Emergency," *Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics* 32 (2004): 565-73

- Meena Krishnamurthy and Matthew Herder, "Justice in Global Pandemic Preparedness: An Analysis Based on the Values of Contribution, Ownership, and Reciprocity," *Public Health Ethics* 3 (2013): 272-86
- Anita Ho and Iulia Dascalu, "Global Disparity and Solidarity in a Pandemic," *Hastings Center Report* 50.3 (2020): 65-67
- Jennifer Prah Ruger, "Positive Public Health Ethics: Toward Flourishing and Resilient Communities and Individuals," *American Journal of Bioethics* 20.7 (2020): 44-54
- Thana de Campos, "Guiding Principles of Global Health Governance in Times of Pandemics: Solidarity, Subsidiarity, and Stewardship in COVID-19," *American Journal of Bioethics* 20.7 (2020): 212-14
- Nancy Jecker, "Global Sharing of COVID-19 Vaccines: A Duty of Justice, not Charity," *Developing World Bioethics* 23 (2023): 5-14
- Felicitas Holzer, Tania Manrique Roa, Frederico Germani, Nikola Biller-Andorno, and Florencia Luna, "Charity or Empowerment? The Role of COVAX for Low- and Middle-Income Countries," *Developing World Bioethics* 23 (2023): 59-66
- Group A reflection due, 9 pm, April 16*

Apr 24

Third tutorial/Final assignment due