Philosophy 313
Global Health Ethics

Spring 2026
Lattimore 531, W 2:00-4:40

Richard Dees, Ph.D.
Office: Lattimore 529
Hours: W 11:00-1:00
and by appointment
richard.dees@rochester.edu

The world is interconnected, and what happens in one country affects—both directly and indirectly—what happens in other countries. For health issues this fact is especially true, as the rapid spread of Covid-19 vividly demonstrated. The moral issues that arise from these interconnections are particularly vexing, and this class will examine some of them. Is the 40-year gap in life expectancy between Sierra Leone and Japan unjust? Is the "brain drain' of health care workers from poorer countries to richer countries unfair? Does the global market in organs create ethical problems? Do obligations do individuals and countries have to alleviate the health burdens in the world? If so, how great is that obligation? How can such aid be provided ethically?

Required Texts:
All readings on Blackboard

Course Requirements:
Class participation is worth a significant portion of your grade. The class is based on student discussions, not on lectures. You are expected to come to class, and you are expected to come to class prepared to discuss the readings – if only to ask relevant questions about them. Most of your class participation grade is based on regular, substantive participation in class discussions.

Reflection papers. Five times during the semester, you will be expected to write a brief 1-2 page double-spaced reaction paper to the upcoming week's reading, due at 9:00 p.m. on the Tuesday before class. Please email them to me. These papers should respond to some specific arguments or position in the readings by explaining why you agree or disagree with it. Each is worth 8 points. You can find the group assignments in the Assignments folder.

Paper assignments. The major assignments in this course will be done using a tutorial system. For the first two papers, I will give you a series of questions about particular texts, and I will ask you to respond to them in a paper of 6-8 pages. You and another student will meet with me in my office during the time set aside for that purpose. Together, the three of us will discuss each of your papers. While attending a tutorial is required, you will graded only on what is in your paper. I will explain the tutorial method in more detail later.

For your final assignment, you will have a choice: you may either write a third tutorial of 7-10 pages on a topic I will give you, or you may write a 7-10 page paper on a topic of your own choosing. This latter option will give you the opportunity to explore an issue of particular interest

to you at greater length. Note that the paper must be a *philosophy* paper: it should explain and evaluate a line of argument about some question related to the topics of the course. I will be happy, however, to help you develop your topic. In any case, if you choose to write a paper, you *must* consult me.

In addition, students are encouraged to form study groups to discuss the issues raised in the course. If you have a group and you would like me to meet with it, please contact me, and I will be happy to attend.

The course grade is divided into 560 points, apportioned as shown:

First tutorial	Feb 25	120 points
Second tutorial	Apr 1	120 points
Final assignment	Apr 29	140 points
Reaction papers		40 points
Participation		140 points

Academic honesty: The Honor Pledge will be required on the papers for the course. I expect the work on these assignments to be your own; all quotations and *ideas from others* that are used in your work must be properly cited. The reflections papers are more informal, so I do not expect rigorous citations or the Pledge, but I do expect the work to be your own. The use of AI tools to complete or aid with any graded assignment in this class is strictly forbidden. This is an ethics course, and I take a particularly dim view of violations of academic honesty. Please consult the College's policy at www.rochester.edu/College/honesty/. If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Schedule of Readings

This schedule is tentative (especially for topics later in the course). However, any changes will be announced on Blackboard, and an up-to-date copy of the syllabus can always be found on Blackboard. All readings are in the Readings folder on Blackboard.

Jan 21 Introduction
Ivan Illich, "To Hell with Good Intentions"

I. The ethics of globalized health care

Brain drain

WHO Global Code of Practice on the International Recruitment of Health Personnel, May 2010

Abraar Karan, Daniel DeUgarte, and Michele Barry, "Medical 'Brain Drain' and Health," *AMA Journal of Ethics* 18 (2016): 665-75

Javier S. Hidalgo, "The Active Recruitment of Health Workers: A Defence," *Journal of Medical Ethics* 39 (2013): 603-09

Gillian Brock, "Is Active Recruitment of Health Workers Really Guilty of Enabling Harm or Facilitating Wrongdoing?," *Journal of Medical Ethics* 39 (2013): 612-14

Kiran Oberman, "Can Brain Drain Justify Immigration Restrictions?," *Ethics* 123 (2013): 427-55

Luara Ferracioli and Pable De Lora, "*Primum Nocere*: Medical Brain Drain and the Duty to Stay," *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* 50 (2015): 601-19

Paul Bou-Habib, "The Brain Drain as Exploitation," *Politics, Philosophy, and Economics* 21 (2022): 249-68.

Jan 28 Medical tourism

I. Glenn Cohen, "Medical Tourism," in *Routledge Companion to Bioethics*, ed. John Arras, Elizabeth Fenton, and Quill (Rebecca) Kukla (London: Routledge, 2015), 99-113

Cynthia Cohen and Peter Cohen, "International Stem Cell Tourism and the Need for Effective Regulation. Part 1: Stem Cell Tourism in Russia and India: Clinical Research, Innovative Treatment, or Unproven Hype," *Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal* 20 (2010): 27-49

Charles Murdoch and Christopher Thomas Scott, "Stem Cell Tourism and the Power of Hope," *American Journal of Bioethics* 10.5 (2010): 16-23

Y.Y. Brandon Chen and Colleen Flood, "Medical Tourism's Impact on Health Care Equity and Access in Low- and Middle-Income Countries: Making the Case for Regulation," *Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics* 41 (2013): 286-300

G.K.D. Crozier, "Reproductive Travel and Tourism," in Arras, Fenton, and Kukla, 393-402

Vida Panitch, "Surrogate Tourism and Reproductive Rights," *Hypatia* 28 (2013): 274-89

Group A reflection due, 9 pm, January 27

Feb 4 Organ markets

Nancy Scheper-Hughes, "Mr. Tati's Holiday and João's Safari—Seeing the World Through Transplant Tourism," *Body and Society* 17 (2011): 55-92

Janet Radcliffe-Richards, et al. "The Case for Allowing Kidney Sales," *Lancet* 352 (1998): 1950-52

Michael Gill and Robert Sade, "Paying for Kidneys: The Case Against Prohibition," *Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal* 12 (2002): 17-45

Paul M. Hughes, "Exploitation, Autonomy, and the Case for Organ Sales," *International Journal of Applied Philosophy* 12 (1998): 89-95

I. Glenn Cohen, "Transplant Tourism: The Ethics and Regulation of International Markets for Organs," *Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics* 41 (2013): 269-85

Group B reflection due, 9 pm, February 3

Feb 11 Global research

World Medical Association, Declaration of Helsinki: Ethical Principles for Medical Research Involving Human Subjects

Peter Lurie and Sidney M. Wolfe, "Unethical Trials of Interventions to Reduce Perinatal Transmission of the Human Immunodeficiency Virus in

Developing Countries," *New England Journal of Medicine* 337 (1997): 853-56

Carol Levine, "Placebos and HIV Lessons Learned," *Hastings Center Report* 28.6 (1998): 43-48

Marcia Angell, "Investigators' Responsibilities for Human Subjects in Developing Countries," *New England Journal of Medicine* 342 (2000): 967-69; Ronald H. Gray, Thomas C. Quinn, David Serwadda, Nelson K. Sewankambo, Fred Wabware-Mangen, Maria J. Wawer, "The Ethics of Research in Developing Countries," *New England Journal of Medicine* 343 (2000): 361-62; Marcia Angell, "Reply," *New England Journal of Medicine* 343 (2000): 363.

Alex John London, "The Ambiguity and the Exigency: Clarifying 'Standard of Care' Arguments in International Research," *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* 25 (2000): 379-97

Ezekiel Emanuel, "Global Justice and the 'Standards of Care' Debate," in Joseph Millum and Ezekiel, eds., *Bioethics and Global Justice* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 181-212

Alan Wertheimer, "The Obligations of Researchers Amidst Injustice or Deprivation," in Millum and Emanuel, 279-304

Group A reflection due, 9 pm, February 10

Feb 18 <u>New drugs and property rights</u>

Move: "The Constant Gardener"

P. Chirac, R. von Schoen-Angerer, T. Kasper, and N. Ford, "AIDS: Patent Rights versus Patient's Rights," *Lancet* 356 (2000): 502

Donald Berwick, " 'We All Have AIDS': Case for Reducing the Cost of AIDS Drugs to Zero," plus commentaries from Richard Sykes and Zackie Achmat, *British Medical Journal* 324 (2002): 214-218

Anand Grover, Brian Citro, Mihir Mankad, and Fiona Lander, "Pharmaceutical Companies and Global Lack of Access to Medicines: Strengthening Accountability under the Right to Health," *Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics* 40 (2012): 234-50

Nicole Hassoun, "Global Health Impact: A Basis for Labeling and Licensing Campaigns?," *Developing World Bioethics* 12 (2012): 121-34

Aisling McMahon, "Global Equitable Access to Vaccines, Medicines, and Diagnostics for COVID-19: The Role of Patents as Private Governance," *Journal of Medical Ethics* 47 (2021): 142-48

Group B reflection due, 9 pm, February 17

Feb 25 *First tutorials (No regular class meeting)*

Mar 4 <u>Female genital cutting</u>

WHO statement on Female Genital Mutilation (2023)

Martha Nussbaum, "Judging Other Cultures: The Case of Genital Mutilation," in *Sex and Social Justice* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 118-29

Clare Chambers, "Are Breast Implants Better than Female Genital Mutilation?: Autonomy, Gender Equality, and Nussbaum's Political Liberalism," *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* 7.3 (2004): 1-33

S.K. Hellsten, "Rationalising Circumcision: From Tradition to Fashion, From Public Health to Individual Freedom—Critical Notes on the Persistence of the Practice of Genital Mutilation," *Journal of Medical Ethics* 30 (2004): 248-53

Public Policy Advisory Network on Female Genital Surgeries, "Seven Things to Know about Female Genital Surgeries," *Hastings Center Report* 42.6 (2012): 19-27

Brian Earp, "Between Moral Relativism and Moral Hypocrisy: Reframing the Debate on 'FGM,'" *Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal* 26 (2016): 105-44

Group A reflection due, 9 pm, March 3

Mar 11 *Spring Break (No classes)*

Mar 18 <u>The work of NGOs</u>

Adamson Muulu, "We Are Not Just a 'Tiny Landlocked Impoverished Sub-Saharan Country with HIV Burden,'" *Croatian Medical Journal* 51 (2010): 560-62

Lisa Fuller, "International NGO Health Programs in a Non-ideal World: Imperialism, Respect, and Procedural Justice," in Millum and Emanuel, 213-40

Anji Wall, "The Context of Ethical Problems in Medical Volunteer Work," *HEC Forum* 23 (2011): 79-90

L. Lewis Wall, "Ethical Concerns Regarding Operations by Volunteer Surgeons on Vulnerable Patient Groups: The Case of Women with Obstetric Fistulas," *HEC Forum* 23 (2011): 115-27

Lisa Fuller, "Justified Commitments?: Considering Resource Allocation and Fairness in Médcins Sans Frontières-Holland," *Developing World Bioethics* 6 (2006): 59-70

Group B reflection due, 9 pm, March 17

II. Health justice for the world

Mar 25 <u>Global justice: Rule of rescue and Reparations</u>

Peter Singer, "Famine, Affluence, and Morality," *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 1 (1972): 279-43

Thomas Pogge, " 'Assisting' the Global Poor," in *Global Justice*, ed. Christian Barry and Holly Lawford-Smith (London: Routledge, 2012), 67-95

Paul Farmer, Peter Drobac, and Zoe Agoos, "The Colonial Roots of Global Health," *Harvard College Global Health Review* 2009

Helen Tilley, "Medicine, Empire, and Ethics in Colonial Africa," *AMA Journal of Ethics* 18 (2016): 743-53

Ted Schrecker, Anne-Emmanuelle Birn, and Mariajosé Aguilera, "Challenging the Global Extractive Order: A Global Health Imperative," in *Global Health: Ethical Challenges*, 2nd ed., ed. Solomon Benatar and Gillian Brock (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2021), 256-68

Group A reflection due, 9 pm, March 24

Apr 1 *First tutorials (No regular class meeting)*

Apr 8 <u>Global justice: Human rights and health</u>

Paul Farmer, "On Suffering and Structural Violence: Social and Economic Rights in the Global Era," in *Pathologies of Power: Health, Human Rights, and the New War on the Poor* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), 29-50

Declaration of Alma Ata (1978)

Jonathan Wolff, "The Demands of the Human Right to Health," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 86 (2012): 217-37

Gopal Sreenivasan, "A Human Right to Health?: Some Inconclusive Scepticism," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 86 (2012): 239-65

Matthew Liao, "Human Rights and Public Health," in *Oxford Handbook of Public Health Ethics*, ed. Anna Mastroianni, Jeffrey Kahn, and Nancy Kass (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), 47-56

Kimberley Brownlee, "Do We Have a Human Right to the Political Determinants of Health?," in *Philosophical Foundations of Human Rights*, ed. Rowan Cruft, S. Matthew Liao, and Massimo Renzo (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015), 502-14.

Group B reflection due, 9 pm, April 7

Apr 15 <u>Global justice: Cosmopolitanism and health</u>

Nicole Hassoun, "World Poverty and Freedom," *American Philosophical Quarterly* 45 (2008): 191-98

Thomas Nagel, "The Problem of Global Justice," *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 33 (2005): 113-47

Joseph Millum, "Global Bioethics and Political Theory," in *Global Justice and Bioethics*, ed. Joseph Millum and Ezekiel Emanuel (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 17-42

Lucy Thompson, "Extreme Poverty Has Been Sharply Cut. What Has Changed?" *New York Times*, 2 December 2021

Allen Buchanan and Matthew DeCamp, "Responsibility for Global Health," *Theoretical Medicine and Bioethics* 27 (2006): 95-114

Onora O'Neill, "Agents of Justice," *Metaphilosophy* 32 (2001): 180-95

(optional) Angus Deaton, "Health in the Age of Globalization," *Brookings Trade Forum* (2004): 81-130

Group A reflection due, 9 pm, April 14

Apr 22 Pandemics

World Health Organization, *Ethical Considerations in Developing a Public Health Response to Pandemic Influenza* (2007)

Lawrence Gostin, "Pandemic Influenza: Public Health Preparedness for the Next Global Health Emergency," *Journal of Law, Medicine, and Ethics* 32 (2004): 565-73

Meena Krishnamurthy and Matthew Herder, "Justice in Global Pandemic Preparedness: An Analysis Based on the Values of Contribution, Ownership, and Reciprocity," *Public Health Ethics* 3 (2013): 272-86

Anita Ho and Iulia Dascalu, "Global Disparity and Solidarity in a Pandemic," *Hastings Center Report* 50.3 (2020): 65-67

Jennifer Prah Ruger, "Positive Public Health Ethics: Toward Flourishing and Resilient Communities and Individuals," *American Journal of Bioethics* 20.7 (2020): 44-54

Thana de Campos, "Guiding Principles of Global Health Governance in Times of Pandemics: Solidarity, Subsidiarity, and Stewardship in COVID-19," *American Journal of Bioethics* 20.7 (2020): 212-14

Nancy Jecker, "Global Sharing of COVID-19 Vaccines: A Duty of Justice, not Charity," *Developing World Bioethics* 23 (2023): 5-14

Felicitas Holzer, Tania Manríque Roa, Frederico Germani, Nikola Biller-Andorno, and Florencia Luna, "Charity or Empowerment? The Role of COVAX for Low- and Middle-Income Countries," *Developing World Bioethics* 23 (2023): 59-66

Group B reflection due, 9 pm, April 14

Apr 29 *Third tutorial/Final assignment due*